

# CTHCI Lab 4

## Writing a Review

# Criteria for a Good Paper

- **Contribution:** What new insight does it bring to the field?
- **Benefits:** What can one learn from this / do with this?
- **Novelty:** Prior publications?
- **Validity:** Are the claims properly backed up?
- **Applicability:** How good does the paper match the likely audience?
- **Format:** Readability and clarity

# Structure of a Review

- Overall rating: 1: definite reject – 5: definite accept
- Short summary of the contributions and benefits
  - “This paper presents... (who) will benefit from (what)”
- Concerns
  - Originality
  - Validity
  - Clarity
- Suggestions for improvement
- Reviewer’s expertise: 1: no knowledge – 4 expert

# Reviewing Checklist

- Recommending **accept**
  - Convince yourself that it has **no serious defects**
  - Convince the editor that it is of an acceptable standard, by explaining why it is **original, valid, and clear**
  - List the changes that should be made before it appears in print
    - Where possible: indicating not just *what to change* but *what to change it to*
  - Take reasonable care in checking details, e.g, mathematics, formulas, and bibliography
- Recommending **reject**
  - **Clearly explain the faults** and, where possible, discuss how they could be rectified
  - Indicate which parts of the work are of **value** and which should be **discarded**
  - Check the paper to a reasonable level of detail

From *Writing for Computer Science* (Zobel, 2004)

# Reviewing Checklist

- Always do the following in either case
  - Provide good **references** with which the authors should be familiar
  - Ask yourself whether your comments are **fair, specific, and polite**
  - Be honest about **your limitations** as a referee of that paper
  - **Check your review** carefully as you would check one of your own paper prior to submission

From *Writing for Computer Science* (Zobel, 2004)

# In-Class Practice

Writing a review of an evaluation section

- Presentation Strategies for Micro-Navigation in the Physical World
- Grabrics: A Foldable Two-Dimensional Textile Input Controller